

# **KENTUCKY CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION TASK FORCE**

## **Minutes of the 5th Meeting of the 2019 Interim**

**October 2, 2019**

### **Call to Order and Roll Call**

The 5th meeting of the Kentucky Career and Technical Education Task Force was held on Wednesday, October 2, 2019, at 10:00 AM, in Room 129 of the Capitol Annex. Senator Mike Wilson, Chair, called the meeting to order, and the secretary called the roll.

Present were: David Horseman, Assistant Commissioner, Kentucky Department of Education (KDE).

Members: Senator Mike Wilson, Co-Chair; Representative Bobby McCool, Co-Chair; Senators David P. Givens, Jimmy Higdon, and Johnny Ray Turner; Representatives Kevin D. Bratcher, C. Ed Massey, and Reginald Meeks; and Steven Thomas.

LRC Staff: Jo Carole Ellis, Yvette Perry, Lauren Busch, Seth Dawson, Chuck Truesdell, and Christal White.

### **Approval of Minutes – September 11, 2019**

On a motion by Senator Turner and a second by Representative Bratcher, the minutes of the September 11, 2019, meeting were adopted.

### **Recap of Task Force Testimony**

Senator Wilson provided a summary of the Kentucky Career and Technical Education (KCTE) Task Force meetings, including an overview of Kentucky's Career and Technical Education (CTE) system, an overview of CTE funding, and the study of CTE systems in other states. The specific objectives addressed by the task force included inequity to access, inequity in the funding of various centers, and inequity in pay structures.

### **Discussion of Strategies for the Future of Kentucky's Career and Technical Education System**

Dr. Horseman discussed KDE's recommendations and strategies for the future of Kentucky's CTE system. He said the worst disparities within the CTE system include the funding structure and providing equal opportunities for students. Due to demographic and geographic differences throughout the state, the overall structure of CTE funding should relate to economic development, workforce boards, and regional workforce needs coupled with a positive education alignment. Dr. Horseman said the overall vision includes cooperative centers with regional approaches, joint governances, and the sharing of resources including partnerships with postsecondary institutions. KDE has utilized the

New Skills for Youth (NSFY) program, inter-local agreements, fund sharing, and district and local leadership partnerships.

Moving from five methods of funding to one system is critical. Based on KDE's calculations, Dr. Horseman estimated \$3 million would cover the unfunded programs and centers.

Referring to the KDE OCTEST Superintendent Survey for Local ATC Management, Dr. Horseman said it is important to understand, determine, and identify districts willing and able to operate their own centers. Of the 11 single-feeder Area Technology Center (ATC) respondents, six districts stated they would be willing to assume management of their state-operated ATC, with the condition that current funding, increased funding, or adequate funding is provided. The remaining five districts indicated they would not want to assume management of their state-operated ATC, voicing funding as the underlying reason or concern. Of the 27 multiple-feeder districts that completed the survey, 12 superintendents indicated they would consider assuming total control of ATCs as long as adequate funding is made available. All 12 districts expressed a need of assurance that currently participating districts would still have access through either a similar system or through inter-local agreements and contracts. The remaining 15 superintendents said they were open to considering a shared governance with current participating districts or a regional governance structure. Specifically, two respondents stated a preference in structures currently being built through Kentucky's NSFY regional career academy approach. Although an error in the survey did not allow multiple-feeder districts to answer "no" as to whether they would like to assume management of their state-operated ATC, the feedback was abundantly clear that lack of adequate funding would be a major deterrent.

Dr. Horseman said KDE recommended providing funding for currently unfunded programs that are part of the Local Area Vocational Education Centers (LAVECs). Another KDE recommendation is to establish policies and procedures for requesting, approving, and closing programs within centers. KDE wants to be included in the structural conversation for establishing new LAVECs similar to the process with ATCs, offering approval for programs that would qualify for funding and including local business and industry in the funding model. This would allow KDE a process to replace programs that are no longer beneficial for a particular district or move them to an area with a greater need.

KDE is working on language to correct the existing funding formula conflict between statute and regulation.

KDE's recommendation includes transferring ATCs that agree to local operation. Dr. Horseman said if all funding is distributed evenly between LAVECs and ATCs, the full-time equivalent (FTE) amount would be \$3500. Support for supply needs and increasing operational costs for district buildings comes from the current 20 percent SEEK

funding. Dr. Horseman said KDE has seen success with a dozen ATCs who contracted with local district principals to operate the centers. The principals are on loan from the district and KDE contracts provide most of the districts a flat-rate, entry-level salary for the positions. Districts provide the retirement and additional salary and benefit expenses. With approximately 65 percent of the funding provided in this model, each district would provide \$200,000. Understandably, this amount is more manageable in multiple-feeder districts than single-feeder districts.

Dr. Horseman said that using the formula provided in KRS 156.844 to transition an ATC to local operation would provide \$200,000 for LAVECs. He said phasing in eight to 10 districts could provide \$1 million to \$1.5 million to LAVECs who have received no additional funding over the last 10 years. As other districts are phased in over a five- to ten-year period, districts would have time to decide whether to operate on their own. Dr. Horseman said any statutory changes should require inter-local agreements for LAVECs to achieve equity and access. He said the phased-in approach is suggested as a cautious approach to address any changes in a manner as to not disturb the success in other centers.

In response to a question from Senator Wilson, Dr. Horseman explained FTEs are calculated by multiplying the number of students by the number of hours per day a student attends and dividing that amount by 6, the number of periods in a day.

Responding to a question from Senator Higdon, Dr. Horseman said over the years five or six ATC centers have converted to LAVECs. In response to a follow-up question, Dr. Horseman said the language states that 100 percent of the funds would go to the district for a year and then be deposited into the LAVEC reserve, and all LAVECs would draw from those funds. Responding to a follow-up question, Dr. Horseman said becoming a district employee during the first year does not grant continuing status. State ATC employees fall under KRS 156 while district employees are under KRS 161. Under KRS 156, the interpretation by KDE is that a job change from district to district creates a one-year probation status without requiring continuing status. With an ATC conversion to local control, Dr. Horseman said districts determine whether to grant employees continuing status. Dr. Horseman said district needs and availability of funds determine if tenure will or will not be granted, creating a huge concern for teachers and principals. Senator Wilson said guidelines under the Education Professional Standards Board (EPSB) provide for alternative certification. Dr. Horseman said the ranking system is akin to the system used for general education teachers.

Representative McCool expressed concern regarding tenured or continuing status teachers being terminated without cause. He agreed with the need to provide additional funding to LAVECs and continued support of ATCs. Representative McCool said identifying high-cost programs with community needs should be the driving force. With changing market demands, Dr. Horseman said the review of regional labor market data, traffic patterns, and the needs of business and industry partners is critical. He suggested

levels of funding could vary for particular programs. Representative McCool said his concern lies with equal access for students if program locations are moved. Dr. Horseman said inter-local agreements for the operation of centers and partnering districts with fund sharing will ensure efficiency and opportunities for everyone.

To eliminate confusion, Senator Givens requested Dr. Horseman submit KDE's interpretation written in a one-page report and return it to the task force. He asked for the report to include how the conversion from a state center to a local center impacts employees, the normal mode of operation of a state center from one year to the next, and how that affects certified staff and credentialed employees.

Senator Wilson said the KCTE Task Force results and recommendations will be presented to the ICE on November 20<sup>th</sup>.

Senator Givens recommended the task force provide a finalized work product in the form of a review of discovery, a solution, and draft legislation that can be amended as changes are suggested. He said the guiding principles should be what is best for teachers, students, and taxpayers but the competing interests and loss of money for ATCs if LAVEC models are added to the FTE equation will be a difficult decision.

Dr. Horseman said a continuous-improvement model used for accountability in ATCs and CTCs evaluates data for industry-recognized certifications, enrollment, and completion of programs to determine the standards of quality programs. Senator Givens said the current system is flawed and long-term outcomes are needed.

Senator Givens recapped the recurring consensus of testimony heard by the task force as being: 1) equitable funding mechanism consistent with a phase-in system; 2) one governance model with a regional framework; 3) local driven curriculum and delivery; and 4) substantial coordination oversight and approval by the state with phasing in change. He cautioned against disturbing the success of the current successful programs throughout the state.

Dr. Horseman said the NSFY grant was more efficient when working through inter-local agreements by bringing academic teachers to a central location and providing required academic instruction, reducing travel time for students. He said six inter-local agreements are currently being reviewed, new pathways are being added, and access on a pro-rated basis of available funds are being used.

Senator Givens said a conscious effort to focus on a regionalized approach cannot be overstated. Although he said phasing in change is wise, the 10-year plan would fail current students. Dr. Horseman predicted 60 to 70 percent could most likely be completed within a five-year plan. In rural areas, KDE is considering work-based learning through a virtual workspace within the schools or through engaging students in other ways.

Senator Givens said once sufficient funding is provided for regional entities to deliver quality curriculum, technology, and education to future workers, a performance-funding solution driven by good credentials and good jobs would benefit businesses and taxpayers.

Dr. Horseman said Kentucky has been asked to work on a Credentials of Value Institute with heads of the National Association of Manufacturers to determine what certifications are valuable based on regional needs. He said Kentucky's involvement with business and industry is recognized nationally.

Senator Givens said Perkins money requires performance and quality measures. Dr. Horseman said the performance-based indicator KDE will be using moving forward will be based on industry-recognized credentials.

Senator Givens charged the co-chairs to create a bill draft to create conversation regarding questions. He welcome input from principals and superintendents on the draft legislation.

Senator Wilson said geographical areas are challenging. He said performance-based funding must be based on regional needs and remote areas should not be penalized if the top-five pathways in those areas differ from the top five pathways in other regions. Senator Wilson agrees that the phase-in time of 10 years will put Kentucky further behind and once the need evaluation is clearly in place, the performance-based funding is crucial for the success of programs. He encouraged members to provide input relating to legislation drafted by KDE.

### **Other Business**

Co-chairs will discuss if another meeting is needed prior to the IJCE presentation on November 20<sup>th</sup>.

### **Adjournment**

There being no further business before the task force, the meeting was adjourned at 11:30 a.m.